Solid-Liquid Interactions in Deep Planetary Interiors

Alfred Wilson, Andrew Walker, Dario Alfè and Chris Davies report on a meeting bringing together experimental, theoretical, and observational studies of the deep mantles and cores of terrestrial bodies

n 14 October 2022 the RAS Specialist Discussion 'Solid-Liquid Interactions in Deep Planetary Interiors' took place as the first in-person meeting of its kind at Burlington House following the pandemic. The meeting aimed to bring together experimental, theoretical, and observational studies of the deep mantles and cores of terrestrial bodies, with a particular emphasis on their mutual interactions. Solid-liquid interactions deep in the interiors of terrestrial planets shape their evolution and dynamics, the exchanges of mass and energy between cores and mantles, defines the crystallisation sequence of primordial magma oceans, and the power supplies that might sustain magnetic fields. Recent work has suggested that deep solid-liquid regions may be widespread (e.g. Davies & Greenwood 2023), arising at the top and bottom of Earth's core and in the cores of Mars, Mercury, the Moon and Ganymede. Non-equilibrium thermodynamic processes have also been identified as important despite often being ignored in models of core-mantle evolution. The meeting was divided into two halves, first focusing on the metallic cores of terrestrial bodies and the second exploring processes in silicate mantles and magma oceans.

Metallic cores

The morning session began with an invited talk from **Tina Rückriemen** (DLR) entitled 'Freezing metallic cores: Where do all the solids go?' which gave an excellent introductory walkthrough of the various processes by which planetary cores freeze and the ongoing research in the area.

While Earth's liquid core is slowly freezing heavy (compared to the liquid) material from the bottom upwards, core freezing in small planetary bodies such as Mars, Mercury, Ganymede, the Moon and planetesimals might proceed very differently. The direction of freezing depends on the relative gradients of temperature profile and melting temperature in a planet's core. Because of a significant pressure dependence of both quantities, larger planets such as Earth freeze from the inside out whilst the metal cores of small bodies likely solidify from the top to the bottom. Different top-down freezing scenarios can be envisioned depending on the type of solid material and its density compared to that of the liquid.

If the solid forming is heavier than the surrounding liquid, it may evolve as free crystals and 'snows' which fall into the deeper, entirely liquid core (Rückriemen *et al.* 2015). If the solid is lighter it may create a compact, floating solid layer directly below the core mantle boundary. For example, at low pressure, sulphur partitions strongly to the liquid iron, meaning that solid iron is relatively pure when it freezes. This means that as these dense solids sink into the core, they heat up and remelt, creating a dense iron-rich liquid which can drive compositional convection. Ganymede, Mars, the Moon and Mercury all offer unique geodynamo outputs which can each be explained by a snow zone, showing that these processes are powerful and potentially widespread features in planetary evolution.

Ludovic Huguet (CNRS) then presented 'A laboratory model for iron snow in planetary cores', the first talk on an experimental study, where a chilled tank of salt-water forms ice crystals as an inverted analogue for iron snow in planetary cores (Huguet *et al.* 2023; figure 1).

Whilst we can learn a great deal from the 1D thermal evolution of planets, this does not allow us to glean the details of dynamic processes which are providing convective power. In particular, we do not yet understand how iron snows come about in planetary cores, much less how they generate flow on the small scale. To answer these questions we can turn to analogous experiments (e.g. Bergman *et al.* 2005), in this case the freezing of salt water. In the case of iron the solid is always dense compared to the liquid, however, for water ice the opposite is true. 1(a) Schematic view of an iron snow regime in a planetary core. Iron crystals solidify in the liquid bulk close to the core-mantle boundary, and settle into the hotter and deeper part of the liquid core, where they melt. (b) The experimental setup is inverted, with a chilled interface at the base of a tank, producing crystals which detach and float up into the liquid and remelt. (Ludo Huguet)



For this reason, Huguet's experiments are inverted, with a chilled interface at the base of a tank, producing crystals which detach and float up into the liquid and re-melt. The experiments take several days to run and require a fine control of temperature to balance the supercooling (12°C below freezing point) needed to overcome the nucleation barrier (Huguet *et al.* 2018) and form crystals against freezing the entire system. Perhaps most surprising, and important for planetary processes, is the episodic nature of freezing events where a period of intense nucleation and high solid fraction near the base of the tank is followed by relatively low activity. This is due to crystals forming and releasing latent heat on one part of the experiment before floating up and re-melting in a different area.

Andrew Walker (University of Oxford) followed next with 'A non-equilibrium model of slurries in planetary cores'. This talk addressed iron slurries close to the growing inner core of Earth and how we can learn from a theoretical model outside of thermodynamic equilibrium.

Slurry zones are domains in planetary cores with modest fractions of solids crystallising from stably stratified liquid. In the Earth, the F-layer (a region at the lowermost outer core, characterised by a reduction in compressional wave velocity) has been suggested to be a slurry layer (Wong et al. 2021). Here, the growth of particles in the F-layer is examined, without the requirement that they are in equilibrium. An Fe-FeO system is considered, with a thermodynamic model defining melting temperature, solid fraction and growth of particles. Classical nucleation theory defines the formation of new solids, and fluid dynamics informs the sinking of particles and the boundary layer with which they interact. Falling time and particle size are calculated, revealing that the dynamics of the system are most strongly controlled by the viscosity of the liquid and the diffusion rate of O (which slows particle growth with increasing composition). Using the solution from individual particles in a multi-particle case, falling velocity and nucleation rate define the vertical separation of particles. Continued development of this model will provide a description of conditions which can support slurry layers and the thermo-chemical effects that they might have on the evolving core.

Kathryn Dodds (University of Cambridge) presented 'Inwards core crystallisation: Insights from analogue experiments', which was the next of our experimental analogue studies focusing on iron snow. She investigates how fluid flow from sinking crystals might drive convection in small planets.

Studies of snow zones in planetary cores have shown how snows can provide power to geodynamo action (Davies & Pommier 2018). However, this does not translate efficiently to smaller bodies where pressure gradients are low. In these cases, inward crystallisation is expected, however, as crystals fall, they may not re-melt until deep in the liquid core, if at all, greatly reducing potential for compositional convection. This presents a conundrum for asteroids derived from small planetesimals which have palaeomagnetic records suggesting strong magnetic fields (Dodds *et al.* 2021).

So how else can snow zones generate convection in small cores? Dodds performs experiments of supereutectic NH4Cl liquids, cooled (by a chill plate at the top of the experiment tank) to the point where they will spontaneously nucleate ammonium chloride crystals, which then sink into the remaining liquid and form a cumulate at the base of the tank. When a snow regime is entered, crystals form and entrain liquid as they sink, developing downwelling plumes. A test where crystals are not formed, but thermal convection remains, confirms that the crystals are driving greater flow velocities. In an asteroid or small planet, it is therefore reasonable that crystals might form in a layer at the top of the liquid core before detaching as plumes which help drive convection. An evaluation of the magnetic Reynolds number suggests that cores greater than 70km in radius might be able to generate a magnetic field via this process.

Quentin Kriaa (IRPHE) gave the final experimental talk of the morning; 'Compositional convection from iron snow: laboratory modelling with dissolving sugar'. Here, he also studies the overall fluid flow in the presence of dense sinking crystals but does so exclusively with compositional convection.

Thus far, we have considered either that falling snow melts and then drives compositional convection through dense liquids, or that sinking crystals can entrain flow and drive convection in doing so without re-melting. There is, of course, an important region between these extremes, where some of the crystals have remelted and are now sinking as dense liquids, and others (particularly large ones) continue to sink as solids (Kriaa *et al.* 2022).

Kriaa uses experiments to explore the influence of this regime and the effect on the dynamics of downwelling plumes. Dyed sugar crystals are dropped through a sieve into a laser illuminated tank of water with neutrally buoyant tracer markers (figure 2). Because they do not dissolve instantaneously, if a constant mass flux into the experiment is maintained, a steady state region is established where solids are sinking through the water column. As the downward flux of sugar begins, Rayleigh-Taylor instabilities organise the flow of particles into a single plume. Despite the difference in geometry and forces for a planetary core, one would expect the development of downward plumes which periodically exhaust the

2 Sugar crystals (with rhodamine tracer) of mean initial radius 169 microns, sieved with an average mass rate of 0.57q/s, are dropped into water and dissolve to create a dense liquid. The dissolving sugar creates a coherent dense plume which exceeds the falling velocity of the remaining crystals in isolation. The particle size of the sugar defines the dynamics of suspension and entrainment in the system. The width of each snapshot is 16.5 cm and the time interval between snapshots is 3.24s. (Quentin Kriaa)





supply of new crystals at the top of the liquid core and are perhaps more efficient at driving convection than the dense liquids typically considered.

The morning session was concluded by Jac van Driel (UCL), presenting 'Composition of the Martian Core'. He uses a new class of multicomponent equation of state, powered by density functional theory calculations, to decipher recent InSight data of the martian interior.

All talks in the morning session highlighted the important role that composition plays in defining the dynamic processes which are at play in planetary cores; despite this even for Earth's core, composition is poorly constrained. Data from the now-retired NASA InSight mission has found that the martian core is both larger than previously thought and perhaps entirely molten (Stähler *et al.* 2021).

Furthermore, inversion of the new findings gives estimates of the core density and seismic properties, allowing this study to estimate composition. Mars is smaller than Earth, meaning the pressures of its core are significantly lower and largely below the spin transition of iron. This means that whilst calculation of the Earth's core properties can negate the influence of spin states and magnetic entropy, it is imperative that these are considered for Mars.

This study employs density functional theory calculations to calculate the free energy difference between different spin states of the materials being investigated. Once the thermodynamically favoured states are found, properties of individual compositions can be calculated and compared with experimental results. A gaussian regression approach allows the construction of self-consistent equations of state which can estimate the properties of untested compositions. The model finds that a core with 15 wt% S, 3.6 wt% O and 1 wt% H is most compatible with the inverted data.

Mantles and magma oceans

The afternoon session of talks on mantle and magma ocean processes began with an invited talk from **Charles-Édouard Boukaré** (IPGP) titled 'Beyond 1D magma ocean models'. He studies multiphase flow processes to understand how the Earth's early magma ocean evolved into the present day mantle.

The magma ocean is a widely accepted early state of Earth's silicate mantle, thought to arise from a giant impact, perhaps that which formed the Moon (Nakajima & Stevenson 2015). At high pressures, a non-linearity in the melting temperature of mantle silicates means that it is possible for the magma ocean to freeze from the middle outwards, potentially separating surface, and basal magma oceans (Labrosse *et al.* 2007). The dynamics of this process are not well understood as models will typically study only the 1D evolution of the liquid regime, or the 2D evolution of the solid regime, neither capturing this crucial time where both phases are present.

Boukaré uses multiphase physics to model 2D systems where convection is driven by thermal and chemical density contrasts as well as allowing crystals to grow and remelt (figure 3). The latter effect also introduces latent heat and chemical fractionation. The main finding is that the melt mobility in these models has a strong effect on the final state of the mantle. When melt mobility is low, the system remains well mixed with crystals and liquids entrained in the same flows. When mobility is high, liquids can be expelled from slurry



Downloaded from https://academic.oup.com/astrogeo/article/65/3/3.18/7683038 by Eastman Dental Institute user on 05 September 2024

3 A multiphase 2D convection model of Earth's mantle which includes both thermal and chemical convection alongside phase changes. The long term stability and growth of solid lower-mantle features depends primarily on the melt mobility of the system, which controls how a dense cumulate can expel trapped liquids. Features which share characteristics with seismically observed lower mantle features can be produced and destroyed by tuning this melt mobility. (Charles-Édouard Boukaré)

layers and more strongly fractionate the magma ocean. At an extreme, this produces mantle stratification too strong to be mixed by convection, and structures that are incompatible with seismic observation of the deep Earth. In an intermediate case, a basal magma ocean is generated via fractionation, without the need for a mid-depth crystal barrier, and features similar to those observed atop the present day core mantle boundary can be preserved. In the future, constraints from geochemical tracers will be included to elucidate a range of plausible melt mobilities.

Maxim Ballmer (UCL) followed with a complimentary talk: 'Reactive Crystallisation of the Basal Magma Ocean: Consequences for present-day mantle structure'.

The previous talk highlighted the importance of the evolving structure of the magma ocean on the subsequent features of the mantle. However, the evolution of the late stages of the magma ocean, where a basal magma ocean is present, can be



challenging to reconcile with the present-day structure and dynamics of the mantle. It has been suggested that stable features at the base of the mantle are derived from the fractional crystallisation of the basal magma ocean which enriches liquids, and therefore late stage solids, in iron (Labrosse et al. 2007). The issue is that when this is modelled, the effect is too great. Thick layers with extremely high densities are formed and would surely be observed today, but they are not. This work studies the ongoing interactions between the basal magma ocean and overlying young mantle. These interactions both promote freezing, through reactive crystallisation, and also reduce the density of the solids destined to be at the base of the modern mantle. If subducted from the planet's surface early crustal material is also able to interact with the basal magma ocean and a range of mantle features become possible. Lower mantle features become more reasonably dense and neutrally buoyant mid mantle structures can be generated (Ballmer et al. 2017; figure 4). If reactive crystallisation is a necessary

part of Earth's thermochemical evolution, it could also explain properties of other planets. Venus has had large-scale resurfacing events, which might have exhausted its magma ocean, whilst the stagnant lid regime of the Martian crust might suggest a basal magma ocean is extant and very dense.

Helen Williams (University of Cambridge) then offered a logical progression from the previous two talks with 'Iron isotopes trace primordial magma ocean material in the Earth's upper mantle'. Williams asks if the preserved isotopic signatures of the rock record can describe the differentiation of the Earth's mantle.

The possibility of geochemical tracers for tracking differentiation of the magma ocean and mantle is an exciting prospect. Stable isotopes are often fractionated by processes in nature including in the deep Earth. Mantle plumes which reach the Earth's surface as hot spots deliver material from as deep as the core and give a glimpse into the deep interior as well as the past. Unfortunately, modern samples 4 Predicted evolution of the mantle for two regimes of mixing. Results for a reference case (a, b) and an example case (c-f) show efficient mixing and persistence of large-scale heterogeneity, respectively. This difference in mantlemixing efficiency between cases highlights the role of compositional rheology. (Maxim Ballmer) feature many signals that are challenging to untangle and so it is helpful to focus on ancient rocks when studying the differentiation of the Early mantle. The 3.5+ billion year old rocks of Canada and Greenland feature a variety of isotopic anomalies, one of which is elevated m182W and d57Fe (Williams et al. 2021). This signature indicates that the residual melts of a cooling magma ocean equilibrated at moderate pressure with high pressure, oxidised magnesium silicate. This reveals both that the mantle was likely to be oxidised 3.7 billion years ago and that the advection of crystals was active during the freezing of the magma ocean (figure 5). Whilst these highpressure silicates are not expected to have melted when transported to the upper magma ocean, the lower pressures of smaller planets (e.g. Mars, Vesta and Mercury) would mean that they would melt, making the process impossible.

The final presentation of the meeting came from Hannah Rogers (Grenoble): 'Investigating regional heterogeneity at the core-mantle boundary and its impact on outer core flow'. Rogers uses satellite data of the Earth's magnetic field strength to understand how mantle structure may alter the field.

The Earth's geodynamo is generated by the churning of liquid iron in the outer core. The turbulent convection of the core makes this a process which has significant secular variation, with reversals, polar wander, and anomalous patches (Glatzmaier & Roberts 1995). Models of convection in the core suggest that the magnetic field should be far more complex than the largely dipolar field we observe at the surface. This means that the mantle, and potentially stratified layers at the outermost core, have a filtering effect on the field. Rogers uses the secular variation of the Earth's magnetic field, as recorded by the SWARM network of geomagnetism observing satellites, to understand how large structures in the lowermost mantle might provide lateral variation to this filtering effect. LLSVPs (large low-shear-velocity provinces), the origin of which is the focus of both Charles-Édouard and Maxim, are two continent sizes regions extending above the core mantle boundary around 1000km in height. Because they are thermally, and possibly chemically, distinct from the surrounding mantle, they could present different magnetic filtering qualities. Models which simply hope to capture the observed lateral variation in secular field strength are required to have different magnetic filtering qualities inside and outside of these regions. Additionally, whilst results are still emerging, there seems to be a significant correlation between these regions and periods of rapid magnetic field change.

Conclusions

The meeting offered a most welcome coming together of colleagues who had scarce opportunity to do so in the prior two-and-a-half years. The quality of presentations and surrounding discussion was outstanding, and many remarked on how satisfying it was to discuss our common interests in person. The talks only reinforced how important, diverse, and challenging the interactions of solids and liquids are for the evolution of planets. With more focus than ever on experimental analogues, nuanced simulations of two-phase systems and the observable outcomes from these interactions, the field is advancing at tremendous pace. Bridgmanite cumulate formed during fractional crystallisation of magma ocean



Thermal perturbation causes eutectic melting; melts are extracted and recrystallise upon cooling



5 Schematic demonstration of how the mantle component sampled by Isua basalts may have been formed. (a) the formation of the initial bridgmanite (Bg) cumulate with a small amount of interstitial calcium perovskite (CaPv) and ferropericlase (Fp). (b) the chemical effects after a eutectic melt is extracted from the cumulate before recrystallising as a new assemblage in the lower mantle. (Helen Williams)

"Modern samples are challenging to untangle so we focus on ancient rocks when studying the differentiation of the Early mantle"

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors are thankful to the RAS for hosting this Specialist Discussion Meeting and all attendees for their valuable contributions, especially the invited speakers. We acknowledge a Natural Environment Research Council grant, reference NE/ T000228/1, which supports all of the authors.

AUTHORS

Alfred Wilson (A.J.Wilson1@leeds. ac.uk) is a research fellow at the University of Leeds. He is interested in the nucleation of Earth's solid inner core and the thermochemical evolution of the core and uses theoretical geophysics and mineral physics to

Andrew Walker (andrew.walker@ earth.ox.ac.

earth.ox.ac. uk) is a senior research fellow at the University of Oxford. He is a computational geophysicist and mineral physicist who studies the consequences of imperfections in high pressure crystal structures as well as nonequilibrium processes in planetary

interiors. Dario Alfè (d.alfe@ ucl.ac.uk) is a professor of theoretical mineral



(C.Davies@leeds. ac.uk) is a professor of theoretical geophysics at the University of Leeds. His interests lie in understanding the dynamics and evolution of Earth's deep interior, particularly the generation of the geomagnetic field.

REFERENCES

Chris Davies

Ballmer MD et al. 2017 Nature Geoscience 10 236 Bergman MI et al. 2005 Phys. Earth & Planet. Interiors 153 150 Davies CI & Greenwood S 2023 in Core-Mantle Co-Evolution: An Interdisciplinary Approach ed. Nakaaawa Tet al. (Wiley-VCH GmbH) 219 Davies CI & Pommier A 2018 Earth & Planetary Sci. Lett. 481 189 Dodds KH et al. 2021 in 52nd Lunar and Planetary Science Conference LPI Contribution no. 2548 2133 Glatzmaier GA & Roberts PH 1995 Phys. Earth & Planet. Interiors 91 63 Huguet L et al. 2018 Earth & Planetary Sci. Lett. 487 9 Huguet L et al. 2023 Geophys. Res. Lett. 50 e2023GL105697 Kriaa Q et al. 2022 Phys Rev.: Fluids 7 124302 Labrosse S et al. 2007 Nature **450** 866 Nakajima M & Stevenson DJ 2015 Earth & Planetary Sci. Lett. 427 286 Rückriemen T et al. 2015 Geophys. Res.: Planets 120 1095 Stähler SC et al. 2021 Science 373 443 Wong J et al. 2021 Earth &

Wong J et al. 2021 Earth & Planetary Sci. Lett. **560** 116791 Williams HM et al. 2021 Science Adv. **7** eabc7394